IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS BROWNSVILLE DIVISION

STATE OF TEXAS, et al.,	§	
	§	
Plaintiffs,	§	
	§	
V.	§	Case No. 1:18-CV-68
	§	
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.,	§	
	§	
Defendants,	§	
	§	
and	§	
	§	
KARLA PEREZ, et al.,	§	
	§	
Defendant-	§	
Intervenors.	§	

PEREZ DEFENDANT-INTERVENORS' REPLY IN SUPPORT OF DISCOVERY MOTION

Defendant-Intervenors Karla Perez, *et al.* ("Defendant-Intervenors"), hereby file this Reply in support of their Motion to Compel Discovery from Plaintiffs (Dkt. 429).

Plaintiffs stated in their Response, filed today, that "there is no additional information for Alabama and Arkansas to produce" in response to Defendant-Intervenors' subpoenas *duces tecum. See* Dkt. 433 at 3-4. If in fact Plaintiffs have no additional information that responds to Defendant-Intervenors' requests, and Defendant-Intervenors have not received the information they requested, then it may not be possible for Defendant-Intervenors to obtain the information they seek.

As explained in their motion, Defendant-Intervenors filed the motion to protect their ability to receive documents that they had requested in connection with the deposition of two

new witnesses identified by Plaintiffs. *Id.* at 2.¹

In response to the subpoenas *duces tecum*, Plaintiffs produced some documents before and during the depositions of their witnesses, but did not produce all the documents requested by Defendant-Intervenors. Plaintiffs committed to produce further responsive documents if they could identify them. *See* Exhibits A and B. Because the Court's Scheduling Order provided that discovery closed on September 23, 2019, Defendant-Intervenors conferred with Plaintiffs and filed their motion to compel on that day in order to preserve their ability to receive the outstanding discovery. Plaintiffs produced additional responsive documents on October 1, 2019 but again did not produce documents requested by Defendant-Intervenors. *See* Exhibit C.

Defendant-Intervenors requested documents that relate to claims by Plaintiffs Alabama and Arkansas that they expend state Medicaid funds on DACA recipients. Defendant-Intervenors requested that Plaintiffs' witnesses bring documents to their depositions supporting these claims – specifically documents showing that Alabama and Arkansas maintain DACA-related information in their Medicaid databases and that the claimed costs actually are attributable to DACA recipients.

Following review of Plaintiffs' production on October 1, 2019, Defendant-Intervenors informed Plaintiffs that the produced documents were not responsive to the subpoenas *duces tecum* because they did not specifically address DACA. *Id*.

Based on Plaintiffs' representation that "there is no additional information for Alabama and Arkansas to produce" in response to Defendant-Intervenors' requests, Defendant-

¹ On August 7, 2019, Plaintiffs identified 28 new witnesses and produced declarations which totaled 69 pages of new sworn testimony. Defendant-Intervenors ultimately took the depositions of two of those witnesses – Gretel Felton in Montgomery, Alabama on September 12, 2019 and Mary Franklin in Little Rock, Arkansas on September 18, 2019.

Intervenors may be foreclosed from obtaining the information they seek and will request the Court's guidance at the hearing on pending motions scheduled for tomorrow.

Dated: October 7, 2019 Respectfully submitted,

MEXICAN AMERICAN LEGAL DEFENSE AND EDUCATIONAL FUND

By: /s/ Nina Perales
Nina Perales (Tex. Bar No. 24005046);
(SD of Tex. Bar No. 21127)
Attorney-in-Charge
Ernest I. Herrera (Tex. Bar No. 24094718);
(SD of Tex. Bar No. 2462211)
110 Broadway, Suite 300
San Antonio, Texas 78205
Phone: (210) 224-5476
Facsimile: (210) 224-5382

ROPES & GRAY LLP

Email: nperales@maldef.org

Douglas H. Hallward-Driemeier 2099 Pennsylvania Ave NW Washington, DC 20006-6807 (202) 508-4600 (202) 508-4776 (direct dial) Douglas.Hallward-Driemeier@ropesgray.com (Admitted pro hac vice)

GARCÍA & GARCÍA, ATTORNEYS AT LAW P.L.L.C.

Carlos Moctezuma García (Tex. Bar No. 24065265) (SD of Tex. Bar No. 1081768) P.O. Box 4545 McAllen, TX 78502

Phone: (956) 630-3889 Facsimile: (956) 630-3899

Email: cgarcia@garciagarcialaw.com

Attorneys for Proposed Defendant-Intervenors

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, hereby certify that, on the 7th day of October, 2019, I electronically filed the above and foregoing document using the CM/ECF system, which automatically sends notice and a copy of the filing to all counsel of record.

/s/ Nina Perales
Nina Perales

EXHIBIT A

1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2	FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
3	BROWNSVILLE DIVISION
4	CASE NUMBER: 1:18-CV-68
5	STATE OF TEXAS, et al.,
6	Plaintiffs,
7	vs.
8	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.,
9	Defendants,
10	and
11	KARLA PEREZ, et al.,
12	Defendant-Intervenors,
13	and
14	STATE OF NEW JERSEY,
15	Defendant-Intervenor.
16	IT IS STIPULATED AND AGREED by and
17	between the parties that the deposition of
18	Gretel Felton may be taken before Angela Smith
19	McGalliard, RPR, CRR, CCR, at the offices of
20	the Alabama Attorney General, at 501 Washington
21	Ave., Montgomery, Alabama 36104, on the 12th
22	day of September, 2019.
23	DEPOSITION OF GRETEL FELTON
	D 1
	Page 1

1 IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED 2 that the signature to and the reading of the 3 deposition by the witness is not waived, the 4 deposition to have the same force and effect as 5 if full compliance had been had with all laws 6 and rules of Court relating to the taking of 7 depositions. IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED 8 9 that it shall not be necessary for any 10 objections to be made by counsel to any 11 questions except as to form or leading 12 questions, and that counsel for the parties may 13 make objections and assign grounds at the time 14 of the trial, or at the time said deposition is 15 offered in evidence, or prior thereto. 16 IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED 17 that the notice of filing of the deposition by 18 the Commissioner is waived. 19 20 21 22 23 Page 2

1	* * * * * * * * * *
2	I N D E X
3	EXAMINATION
4	PAGE LINE
5	By Ms. Perales 7 18
6	By Mr. Disher 165 14
7	DEFENDANT'S EXHIBITS
8	PAGE LINE
9	Defendant's Exhibit 1 - Notice of
10	Deposition
11	Defendant's Exhibit 2 - Felton resume 17 22
12	Defendant's Exhibit 3 - Declaration
13	signed by G. Felton,
14	August 7, 2019, with
15	previous declaration
16	attached
17	Defendant's Exhibit 4 - Portion of
18	Modified Adjusted Gross
19	Income manual - Bates 354
20	to 425 47 19
21	Defendant's Exhibit 5 -
22	Spreadsheets for
23	individuals with DACA
	Page 3

Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 434-1 Filed on 10/07/19 in TXSD Page 5 of 10

1	designation	93	22
2	Defendant's Exhibit 6 - Subpoena		
3	duces tecum	145	9
4	* * * * * * * * * * * *		
5			
6			
7			
8			
9			
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
		Page	4

1	
1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2	FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
3	BROWNSVILLE DIVISION
4	CASE NUMBER: 1:18-CV-68
5	STATE OF TEXAS, et al.,
6	Plaintiffs,
7	vs.
8	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.,
9	Defendants,
10	and
11	KARLA PEREZ, et al.,
12	Defendant-Intervenors,
13	and
14	STATE OF NEW JERSEY,
15	Defendant-Intervenor.
16	BEFORE:
17	Angela Smith McGalliard,
18	Commissioner.
19	APPEARANCES:
20	TODD L. DISHER, ESQUIRE, of OFFICE OF
21	THE ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS, P.O. Box 12548,
22	Austin, Texas 78711, appearing on behalf of the
23	Plaintiffs.
	Page 5

JAMES WALKER, ESQUIRE, of U.S.
DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, P.O. Box 868,
Washington, D.C. 20044, appearing on behalf of
the Defendants.
WINFIELD J. SINCLAIR, ESQUIRE, of
OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ALABAMA, 501
Washington Ave., Montgomery, Alabama 36104,
appearing on behalf of the Deponent.
JEREMY HOLLANDER, ESQUIRE, of OFFICE
OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEW JERSEY, 25
Market Street, 8th Floor, Trenton, New Jersey
08625, appearing by telephone on behalf of the
Defendant-Intervenor.
NINA PERALES, ESQUIRE, of MALDEF, 110
Broadway, Suite 300, San Antonio, Texas 78205,
appearing on behalf of the
Defendant-Intervenors.
RAMON A. SOTO, ESQUIRE, of MALDEF,
110 Broadway, Suite 300, San Antonio, Texas
78205, appearing on behalf of the
Defendant-Intervenors.
ALSO PRESENT: Bo Offord, Esq.
* * * * *

1	I, Angela Smith McGalliard,
2	Registered Professional Reporter, Certified
3	Realtime Reporter and Certified Shorthand
4	Reporter, of Pike Road, Alabama, acting as
5	Commissioner, certify that on this date, as
6	provided by the Federal Rules of Civil
7	Procedure and the foregoing stipulation of
8	counsel, there came before me at the offices of
9	the Alabama Attorney General, 501 Washington
10	Ave., Montgomery, Alabama 36104, beginning at
11	9:22 a.m., Gretel Felton, witness in the above
12	cause, for oral examination, whereupon the
13	following proceedings were had:
14	GRETEL FELTON,
15	being first duly sworn, was examined and
16	testified as follows:
17	EXAMINATION
18	BY MS. PERALES:
19	Q. Good morning.
20	A. Good morning.
21	Q. My name is Nina Perales, and I am
22	one of the attorneys in this litigation. I
23	represent the group of people in the case known

1	Q. Of course.
2	A. Of course, that's just the MAGI
3	that we're talking about that are in the new
4	system.
5	Q. Okay. Were there any documents
6	that were requested in the subpoena duces tecum
7	that exist but that you weren't able to bring
8	today?
9	MR. SINCLAIR: Object to the
10	form.
11	MR. DISHER: And I'll just add to
12	that one, just so there's clarity, I do I
13	understand, perhaps, that there are some
14	additional documents that are going through the
15	security review process. Those are not the
16	documents that were in Ms. Felton's possession,
17	custody, or control, and those are not
18	documents that she relied on to form the
19	opinions expressed in her declaration. But
20	there may very well be additional documents
21	that are still going through the security
22	review process.
23	MS. PERALES: Okay. Thank you.

1	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE
2	STATE OF ALABAMA,
3	MONTGOMERY COUNTY,
4	I, Angela Smith McGalliard, Registered
5	Professional Reporter, Certified Realtime
6	Reporter, Certified Court Reporter and
7	Commissioner for the State of Alabama at Large,
8	do hereby certify that the above and foregoing
9	proceeding was taken down by me by stenographic
10	means, and that the transcript was produced by
11	computer aid under my supervision, and that the
12	foregoing represents a true and correct
13	transcript of the proceedings occurring on said
14	date and at said time.
15	I further certify that I am neither of
16	kin nor of counsel to the parties to the
17	action; nor in any manner interested in the
18	result of said case.
19	Signed the 26th day of September, 2019.
2 0	Chaple moth Massellist
21	Angela Smith McGalliard
	ANGELA SMITH MCGALLIARD, RPR, CRR, CCR
22	AL CCR Lic. No. 98, Expires 9/30/20
	Notary Expiration 8/13/2023
23	
	Page 167

EXHIBIT B

Transcript of the Testimony of

Franklin, Mary Elizabeth

Date: September 18, 2019

Case: State of Texas, et al. v. United States of America, et al.

Bushman Court Reporting

Connie Williams

Phone: (501) 372-5115 Fax: (501) 378-0077

<www.bushmanreporting.com>

Franklin, Mary Elizabeth 9/18/2019

State of Texas, et al. v. United States of America, et al.

Page 1

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS BROWNSVILLE DIVISION

STATE OF TEXAS, et al.,

PLAINTIFFS

V.

CASE NO. 1:18-CV-68

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.,

DEFENDANTS

and

KARLA PEREZ, et al.,

DEFENDANT-INTERVENORS

and

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

DEFENDANT-INTERVENOR

DEPOSITION OF:

MARY ELIZABETH FRANKLIN

(Taken September 18th, 2019,

at 9:01 a.m.)

	Page 2
1	APPEARANCES
2	ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFFS, ET AL.:
3	TODD L. DISHER, ESQUIRE
4	Trial Counsel for Civil Litigation P.O. Box 12548 Austin, Texas 78711-2548
5	Telephone: 512.936.2266 E-mail: todd.disher@oag.texas.gov
6	ON DEUALE OF MUE UNITED CHARGO OF AMEDICA
7	ON BEHALF OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.:
8	JIM BRADER, CHIEF DEPUTY COUNSEL Donaghey Plaza South
9	700 Main Street Little Rock, Arkansas 72203-1437
10	Telephone: 501.682.1363 E-mail: jim.brader@dhs.arkansas.gov
11	ON BEHALF OF KARLA PEREZ, et al.:
12	
13	NINA PERALES, ESQUIRE RAMON A. SOTO, ESQUIRE MALDEF
14	110 Broadway, Suite 300 San Antonio, Texas 78205
15	Telephone: 210.224.5476 E-mail: nperales@maldef.org
16	rsoto@maldef.org
17	ON BEHALF OF THE STATE OF NEW JERSEY:
18	JEREMY E. HOLLANDER, ESQUIRE (via telephone) Assistant Attorney General
19	Office of the Attorney General of New Jersey 25 Market Street, 8th Floor
20	Trenton, New Jersey 08625 E-mail: jeremy.hollander@law.njoag.gov
21	
22	ALSO PRESENT: ATTORNEY GENERAL LESLIE RUTLEDGE DYLAN L. JACOBS, Assistant Solicitor General
23	323 Center Street, Suite 200 Little Rock, Arkansas 72201
24	Email: Dylan.Jacobs@arkansasag.gov
25	

	Page 71
1	Is that right?
2	A Yes.
3	Q And was there an attachment to that e-mail where
4	Ms. Ashley sends you an attachment?
5	A Yes, that was this [indicating].
6	Q Exhibit 4?
7	A Yes.
8	Q Okay. And then it looks like I see an e-mail above
9	that where you're sending a communication. You're
10	sending an e-mail to Mr. Jacobs; is that right?
11	A Yes.
12	Q That's dated September 3rd?
13	A Yes.
14	Q And was there an attachment to this e-mail?
15	A No. At this point he just got the chain.
16	Q I understand.
17	A He just got the chain, not all the attachments
18	within the chain.
19	MS. PERALES: Okay. So at this point I'd
20	like to request of counsel that we receive the
21	attachments that were associated with these
22	e-mails.
23	MR. DISHER: We will certainly discuss
24	that and look at the attachments and then
25	communicate that back to you whether we can

```
Page 72
1
               produce that. But we'll take a look at it for
2
               sure.
3
                    MS. PERALES: Thank you.
                    MR. DISHER: And presumably there will be
4
5
               redactions that have to be done.
6
                    MS. PERALES: Understood.
7
     BY MS. PERALES:
8
          We have two more e-mail strings associated with
9
     this exhibit, and it looks like there might be a little
    bit of an overlap in some of the e-mails.
10
11
               So if we turn to Bates 441, which is the
12
    beginning of that second string, we see an e-mail from
13
    Ms. Ashley to you on July 26. That looks like the same
14
     e-mail that we see on Bates 439. But I just wanted you
     to confirm that for me.
15
16
          Yes.
     Α
          Then behind that, on Bates page 442, it looks like
17
     the same e-mail that we see on Bates 439; is that right?
18
19
     Α
          Yes.
20
          So we've already talked about those.
21
               And then, of course, I see across the top that
22
     you're sending these e-mails to Mr. Jacobs with an FYI,
2.3
     right?
24
     Α
          Yes.
25
          Then, finally, let's turn to Bates 443, which is
```

501-372-5115

Page 96 1 Exhibit 4 without the claims column. 2 Q Sure. 3 It's not here. Α And I also don't have the unredacted version --4 5 Α That's correct. 6 -- which I presume at some point passes through Q 7 you? 8 Α Yes. 9 Did you receive any other documents that were 10 either explanatory to what you were receiving, or were 11 like backup runs, or anything like that? 12 No. Α 13 Did you bring any documents explaining for 14 Exhibit 4 how much of the amounts represented in the 15 final column total paid amount were reimbursed at 100 percent by CHIP? 16 17 Α No. 18 Did you bring any documents showing how the DACA 19 designation is communicated to your eligibility system 2.0 by the VLP? 21 Α No. 22 MS. PERALES: You mentioned earlier that 23 there was a key of status codes, I guess, for 24 lack of a better word. I believe that that 25 key would be responsive to the subpoena duces

	Page 97
1	tecum. And so I'd like to ask for the
2	production of the key.
3	MR. DISHER: We will look at the key and
4	evaluate to the extent that we have it. [I've]
5	never seen it. And so we'll see if we can
6	find it and we'll take a look at it and we'll
7	communicate with you about it.
8	MS. PERALES: Okay. Thank you.
9	I'd also like to request if there's any
10	document, other than the key document, that
11	shows us how DACA-related information is
12	communicated out of the hub or out of the VLP
13	to the state eligibility system.
14	MR. DISHER: I understand.
15	MS. PERALES: We need a minute.
16	MR. DISHER: Sure.
17	(A recess was taken from 12:18 p.m. to
18	12:24 p.m.)
19	MS. PERALES: I pass the witness.
20	MR. DISHER: Jeremy, do you have any
21	questions?
22	MR. HOLLANDER: No, not at this time.
23	EXAMINATION
24	BY MR. DISHER:
25	Q First I want to talk about the CHIP reimbursement

	Page 105
1	CERTIFICATE
2	
	STATE OF ARKANSAS)
3)
	COUNTY OF PERRY)
4	
5	I, Connie M. Williams, Certified Court
	Reporter and Notary Public, do hereby certify that the
6	facts stated by me in the caption on the foregoing
	proceedings are true; and that the foregoing proceedings
7	were reported verbatim through the use of the
	stenographic method and thereafter transcribed by me or
8	under my direct supervision to the best of my ability,
	taken at the time and place set out on the caption
9	hereto.
1 0	I further certify that in accordance with
10	Rule 30(e) of the Rules of Civil Procedure, review of
11	the transcript was requested by the deponent or a party thereto.
	I further certify that I am not a relative or
12	employee of any attorney or employed by the parties
	hereto, nor financially interested in the outcome of
13	this action, and that I have no contract with the
	parties, attorneys, or persons with an interest in the
14	action that affects or has a substantial tendency to
	affect impartiality, that requires me to relinquish
15	control of an original deposition transcript or copies
	of the transcript before it is certified and delivered
16	to the custodial attorney, or that requires me to
	provide any service not made available to all parties to
17	the action.
18	WITNESS MY HAND AND SEAL this 1st day
	October, 2019.
19	Cennie M. Williams
20	Carolle 411. Walland
	3/101/ ₂
21	
22	CONNIE M. WILLIAMS
	CCR, LS No. 750, Notary Public in
23	and for Perry County, Arkansas
0.4	My Commission Expires 5/2/23
24	
25	

Franklin, Mary Elizabeth 9/18/2019

State of Texas, et al. v. United States of America, et al.

	Page 1	
SIGNATURE OF DEPONENT CERTIFICATE		
that I have re September 18th	MARY ELIZABETH FRANKLIN, do hereby certify read the foregoing deposition, taken on the lest of my	
accurate with	d belief, said deposition is true and n the exception of the following correction	
listed below: PAGE LINE		
	_	
	_	
Witness Signa STATE OF COUNTY OF	ature:	
	SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN TO before me this, 2019.	
My Commission	expires:	

EXHIBIT C

Nina Perales

From: Nina Perales

Sent: Friday, October 04, 2019 7:00 PM

To: 'Disher, Todd'

Cc: Glenn Moramarco; Robins, Jeffrey (CIV); Biggs, Adam; Ramon Soto

Subject: RE: DACA - Discovery

Todd.

Thanks very much for the confirmation.

We have carefully reviewed the documents that Plaintiffs produced this week in response to the subpoenas, as well as the documents provided to us at the depositions.

Although the produced documents describe processes related to Medicaid eligibility determinations by Alabama and Arkansas, they do not mention DACA.

Specifically, the documents to not respond to the requests for "[d]ocuments showing the types of data maintained by the [Alabama Medicaid Agency and Arkansas Department of Human Services] evidencing immigration and citizenship status of Medicaid applicants or beneficiaries." The documents also do not show "the types of data maintained by the [two state agencies] evidencing receipt of DACA by Medicaid applicants or beneficiaries." The documents also do not show when and how Alabama and Arkansas capture and store information showing that Medicaid applicants are recipients of DACA.

Although we understand your position that you have provided responsive documents and your request that we withdraw the motion to compel, we respectfully decline to do so because we do not believe the documents are responsive to the subpoenas duces tecum.

I will be in the office all day Monday and can discuss the matter further at your convenience. Thank you have and have a good weekend,

Nina Perales
Vice President of Litigation
Mexican American Legal Defense
and Educational Fund, Inc. (MALDEF)
110 Broadway, Suite 300
San Antonio, TX 78205
Ph (210) 224-5476 ext. 206
FAX (210 224-5382



CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: The Electronic Communications Privacy Act, 18 U.S.C. §§2510-2521, covers this electronic message. This message and any attachment thereto contains CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION intended for the exclusive use of the named recipient(s) and may further be PRIVILEGED and CONFIDENTIAL attorney client communication, attorney work product or proprietary information. If you are not an intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any use, disclosure, dissemination, distribution, other than to return this message to the addressee(s), notification of its unintended disclosure, and the deletion of all copies is strictly prohibited and may be illegal. If you receive this communication in error, please notify the sender or the person who transmitted the communication immediately by

Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 434-3 Filed on 10/07/19 in TXSD Page 3 of 4

telephone at 210-224-5476 and/or by reply to this communication and delete this message. Persons responsible for delivering this communication to the intended recipient are admonished that this communication not be copied or disseminated except as directed by the intended recipient.

From: Disher, Todd [mailto:Todd.Disher@oag.texas.gov]

Sent: Friday, October 04, 2019 12:29 PM

To: Nina Perales

Cc: Glenn Moramarco; Robins, Jeffrey (CIV); Biggs, Adam; Ramon Soto

Subject: Re: DACA - Discovery

Confirmed. Those are the correct ranges.

Todd Lawrence Disher

Trial Counsel for Civil Litigation
Office of the Attorney General of Texas
P.O. Box 12548 (MC 001)
Austin, TX 78711-2548
(512) 936-2266
Todd.Disher@oag.texas.gov

On Oct 4, 2019, at 11:00 AM, Nina Perales nperales@maldef.org wrote:

Todd,

Thank you for the email and the additional production. We were able to open the link on Tuesday morning and I'd like to verify with you that we accessed all the documents that you produced:

- 1. "AR Docs 2. pdf" containing Bates 764-1134
- 2. "AL Docs 2.pdf" containing Bates 713-763
- 3. "TX v. US DACA Joint Stip.docx"

Please let me know if these are all the documents you produced (with the full page ranges) and that there are no other documents in the encrypted message that may have needed special software to detect.

Many thanks,

Nina Perales
Vice President of Litigation
Mexican American Legal Defense
and Educational Fund, Inc. (MALDEF)
110 Broadway, Suite 300
San Antonio, TX 78205
Ph (210) 224-5476 ext. 206
FAX (210 224-5382

<image001.png>

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: The Electronic Communications Privacy Act, 18 U.S.C. §§2510-2521, covers this electronic message. This message and any attachment thereto contains CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION intended for the exclusive use of the named recipient(s) and may further be PRIVILEGED and CONFIDENTIAL attorney client communication, attorney work product or proprietary information. If you are not an intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any use, disclosure, dissemination, distribution, other than to return this message to the addressee(s), notification of its unintended disclosure, and the deletion of all copies is strictly prohibited and may be illegal. If you receive this communication in error, please notify the sender or the person who transmitted the communication immediately by telephone at 210-224-5476 and/or by reply to this communication and delete this message. Persons responsible for delivering this communication to the intended recipient are admonished that this communication not be copied or disseminated except as directed by the intended recipient.

Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 434-3 Filed on 10/07/19 in TXSD Page 4 of 4

From: Disher, Todd [mailto:Todd.Disher@oag.texas.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, October 01, 2019 5:32 PM

To: Nina Perales; Glenn Moramarco; Robins, Jeffrey (CIV)

Cc: Biggs, Adam

Subject: DACA - Discovery

I just sent all of you documents from Alabama and Arkansas. Please let me know if you do not receive the documents or have trouble accessing the files.

Todd Lawrence Disher

Trial Counsel for Civil Litigation
Office of the Attorney General of Texas
P.O. Box 12548 (MC 001)
Austin, TX 78711-2548
(512) 936-2266
Todd.Disher@oag.texas.gov